

Ser. No. 10/691,512

- 5 -

REMARKS

The Examiner has rejected claims 1-5, 8, 9 and 12-15, for being either anticipated under 102 (e) in view of Nixon or obvious under 103 (a) in view of the teachings of Nixon in combination with those of Madhavan. The Examiner has also indicated that claims 6, 7, 10, 16 and 17 would be allowable if rewritten to include all of the limitations of the base claims and of any other intervening claims.

The Applicant has therefore amended claim 1 to include the limitations of claim 6 and therefore be directed at a control loop diagnostic method including outputting a diagnostic value diagnostic value providing a classification indication of one of tuning error and malfunction of the control loop. Such a control loop diagnostic method is not disclosed by either Nixon or Madhavan, and it would not be obvious in view of any of the cited references, either taken alone or in combination.

The Applicant has similarly amended claim 12 to include the limitations of claim 16 and therefore be directed at a computer readable memory comprising a plurality of instructions which when executed perform steps including outputting a diagnostic value providing a classification indication of one of tuning error and malfunction of the control loop. Such a computer readable memory comprising a plurality of instructions is not disclosed by either Nixon or Madhavan, and it would not be obvious in view of any of the cited references, either taken alone or in combination.


The Applicant has cancelled claims 6, 7, 11 and 16 and has amended the dependency of claim 10.

The Applicant therefore believes that the claims as amended are allowable over the prior art and a Notice of Allowance is earnestly solicited.

Ser. No. 10/691,512

-6-

Respectfully submitted,

ETTALEB *et al.*

C. Marc Benoît, Reg. no. 50,200

OGILVY RENAULT

1981 McGill College Avenue, Suite 1600

Montreal, Quebec,

Canada H3A 2Y3

CUSTOMER NUMBER 20988

CERTIFICATE OF FACSIMILE TRANSMISSION

I hereby certify that this paper is being facsimile transmitted to the
Patent and Trademark Office on the date shown below.

C. MARC BENOÎT, Reg. no. 50,200

Name of person signing certification



Signature

October 13, 2005

Date